

ANTIQUITIES ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of the 138th Meeting
held on Thursday, 21 May 2009 at 4:00 p.m.
in Conference Room, Hong Kong Heritage Discovery Centre
Kowloon Park, Haiphong Road, Tsim Sha Tsui, Kowloon

Present: Mr Bernard Charnwut Chan, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Dr Anissa Chan Wong Lai-kuen, MH, JP
Ms Susanna Chiu Lai-kuen
Mr Patrick Fung Pak-tung, SC
Mr Philip Kan Siu-lun
Mr Laurence Li Lu-jen
Professor Bernard Lim Wan-fung, JP
Dr Tracey Lu Lie-dan
Mr Ng Yat-cheung, JP
Mr Almon Poon Chin-hung, JP
Dr Linda Tsui Yee-wan
Ir Dr Greg Wong Chak-yan, JP
Mr Bryan Wong Kim-yeung
Dr Lee Ho-yin
Ms Heaster Cheung (Secretary)
Chief Administration Manager (Antiquities and
Monuments)
Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Absent with Apologies: Professor Lau Chi-pang;
Dr. Ng Cho-nam;
Professor Simon Shen Xu-hui;
Professor Billy So Kee-long;
Mr. Yeung Yiu-chung;
Mr Andrew Lam Siu-lo;
Ms Lilian Law Suk-kwan;
Mr Kwong Hoi-ying; and
Mrs Mariana Cheng Cho Chi-on, BBS, JP.

In Attendance: Development Bureau

Mr Jack Chan
Commissioner for Heritage

Mr Raymond Chan
Technical Advisor

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr Thomas Chow, JP
Director of Leisure and Cultural Services

Dr Louis Ng
Assistant Director (Heritage and Museums)

Mr Tom Ming
Executive Secretary (Antiquities and Monuments)

Mrs Ada Yau
Curator (Education and Publicity)

Ms Fione Lo
Curator (Historical Buildings)

Mr Kevin Sun
Curator (Archaeology)

Dr Alan Fung
Assistant Curator I (Building Survey)

Miss Pauline Poon
Assistant Curator II (Building Survey)

Mr Hessler Lee
Principal Marketing Coordinator (Heritage and Museums)

Ms Becky Lam
Senior Executive Officer (Antiquities and Monuments)

Planning Department

Mr Raymond Lee Kai-wing
Acting Assistant Director/Metro

Architectural Services Department

Mr S L Lam
Senior Maintenance Surveyor/Heritage

Opening Remarks

The Chairman welcomed members and representatives from the Development Bureau and government departments to the meeting.

Item 1 Confirmation of Minutes of the 137th Meeting held on 25 February 2009 (Board Minutes AAB/1/2009-10)

2. The minutes of the 137th Meeting held on 25 February 2009 were confirmed without amendment.

Item 2 Confirmation of Minutes of the AAB Special Meeting held on 19 March 2009 (Board Minutes AAB/S1/2009-10)

3. The minutes of the AAB Special Meeting held on 19 March 2009 were confirmed without amendment.

Item 3 Confirmation of Minutes of the AAB Special Meeting held on 15 April 2009 (Board Minutes AAB/S2/2009-10)

4. In view of the advisory role of the AAB, a member asked about the appropriateness of using the word “endorse” in paragraph 16 of the meeting minutes regarding the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) of the Old Tai O Police Station. Mr. Jack Chan explained that the HIA mechanism for public works projects emphasized that every effort should be made to avoid or minimize adverse impact arising from the public works projects on heritage sites. The project proponent was required to seek endorsement from the Antiquities and Monuments Office (AMO) on the mitigation measures. According to the prevailing practice, AMO would seek advice from the Board on the findings and recommendations of the HIA. The project proponent should follow the advice and comments from the Board to make necessary amendments. Mr. Jack Chan however reiterated that the AAB played an important advisory role on the issue.

5. Confirming the advice of Mr. Jack Chan, Mr. Thomas Chow further clarified that AAB played an advisory role to the Antiquities Authority regarding declaration of proposed monuments and monuments under the Antiquities & Monuments (A&M) Ordinance. On HIA proposals, members were invited to offer their comments and advice on the mitigation measures proposed in the HIA studies.

6. After deliberation, the proposed amendment of “The Chairman noted that members of the Board were generally supportive of the mitigation measures proposed in the HIA” in paragraph 16 as suggested by a member was supported by the Board.

**Item 4 Matters Arising and Progress Report
(Board Paper AAB/13/2009-10)**

7. Mr. Tom Ming briefed members on the progress of the major heritage issues since the last Board meeting.

8. Apart from the proposed declaration of pre-war waterworks structures as monuments that would be discussed under Board Paper AAB/14/2009-10, Mr. Tom Ming reported that the declaration of the residence of Ip Ting-sz in Sha Tau Kok and Yan Tun Kong Study Hall in Ping Shan as monuments was also being actively pursued. The owners of the said buildings had given consent to the proposed declaration. The notices and plans under section 4 of the A&M Ordinance would be served on them shortly.

9. Mr. Tom Ming further reported the progress of the restoration and maintenance projects being handled by the AMO, highlighting in particular the restoration of King Yin Lei at Stubbs Road. He informed members that the project would be carried out in two phases, i.e. restoration of roof tiles (Phase I) and restoration of internal and external decorative features (Phase II). The whole project was scheduled for completion by the end of 2010. Mr. Tom Ming added that arrangements had been made to record the repair and restoration works with an aim to produce a documentary film at the end.

10. On Wan Chai Market, Mr. Tom Ming reported that with the retention of the façade of the Market, its steel-frame structure would also be preserved in part. The Urban Renewal Authority would properly document the steel-frame structure for record and research purposes in future. He remarked that apart from the Wan Chai Market, there were other pre-war historic buildings of steel-frame structure, which included Kom Tong Hall (currently used as Dr. Sun Yat-sen Museum) and the Main Building of the Queen Mary Hospital.

11. With regard to the proposed grading of 1,444 historic buildings, Mr. Tom Ming said that a total of 139 enquiries and views had been received from the public, press, district councils and government departments. Being part of the public engagement exercise, a series of 6 consultation sessions had been arranged to meet with the 18 District Councils to collect their views during 8 June - 23 July 2009. Upon receipt of all information and views after the completion of the consultation, the Board would make a final decision on the gradings, hopefully by the end of 2009. He added that a visit to some of the pre-war historic reservoirs and buildings with higher proposed gradings would likely be arranged in June and details would be given to members by the Secretariat in due course.

12. Members noted the Progress Report.

**Item 5 Declaration of Pre-war Waterworks Structures as Monuments
(Board Paper AAB/14/2009-10)**

13. Ms Fione Lo briefed members on the proposed declaration of 41 historic waterworks structures within the six pre-war reservoirs, namely Pok Fu Lam Reservoir, Tai Tam Group of Reservoirs, Wong Nai Chung Reservoir, Kowloon Reservoir, Aberdeen Reservoir and Shing Mun (Jubilee) Reservoir waterworks structures as monuments under

section 3(1) of the A&M Ordinance.

14. A member supported the proposal of declaring the waterworks as monuments. He considered that these structures were invaluable in terms of their historical and architectural values. He appreciated particularly the technology adopted in the construction of these complicated water-service-related infrastructures.

15. A member supported the declaration proposal and suggested that more historic structures belonging to the Government be declared.

16. A member appreciated that the proposed declaration of the waterworks structures, which would help preserve Hong Kong's industrial heritage.

17. Mr. Jack Chan informed the Board that upon the declaration of the waterworks structures, probably in September, plans were made in the coming World Water Resource Day to express our gratitude to the civil engineering profession who adopted the western technology in local context, thus creating a feat of reservoir engineering unique to Hong Kong benefitting generations of Hong Kong people. He would also make use of the opportunity to disseminate a message to members of the public to promote the importance of water conservation. Liaison with the Commissioner for Tourism would be made to promote the heritage trails which would link up the waterworks structures to be declared. He hoped that the Water Supplies Department would also assist in publishing pamphlets to promote these new attractions. A member also suggested the Commission for Heritage's Office to work together with the Ocean Park which would have some new initiatives on water conservation by the end of this year.

18. The Chairman and members supported the proposal of declaring the 41 pre-war waterworks structures as monuments.

Item 6 Heritage Impact Assessment of the Heritage Site of Fong Yuen Study Hall (Board Paper AAB/15/2009-10)

19. The Chairman introduced the presentation team:

- (i) Ms Alice Tang
Deputy Chief Executive, Social Service Department of The Yuen Yuen Institute
- (ii) Mr. Calvin Yip
Manager, Social Service Department of The Yuen Yuen Institute
- (iii) Mr. Henry Lo (Heritage Consultant)
Research Project Manager, Centre of Architectural Heritage Research, CUHK
- (iv) Mr. Dean Lee (Architect)
Director, Prudent Design Limited

20. Messrs Henry Lo and Calvin Yip briefed members with a PowerPoint presentation on the result of the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) of the Fong Yuen Study Hall (FYSH), which was conducted in accordance with the HIA mechanism introduced by the Development Bureau (DEVB). They explained to members that approval-in-principle was given by DEVB to turn the study hall into the Tourism & Chinese Cultural Centre cum Ma Wan Residents Museum as proposed by The Yuen Yuen Institute. The FYSH would comprise exhibition galleries, a tourist centre and a learning center, where eco-tours and Chinese cultural and arts courses would be organized. With reference to the conservation management plan (CMP), they briefed members on the key mitigation measures of the FYSH.
21. In brief, the facades and the major architectural features would be preserved. The existing metal roof would be restored to traditional Chinese timber roof while the existing aluminium windows and doors would be restored to timber ones by conservation specialist. New additions including the external staircase and disable platform would be installed in either reversible manner or with minimized visual impact to the major facades.
22. In response to a member's question on the operation of the learning centre of FYSH, Mr. Calvin Yip explained that the exhibition rooms on G/F and the tourist centre on 1/F would be opened during daytime only. However, the learning centre on 1/F would be opened during nighttime to provide educational programmes of Chinese culture and art mainly for residents of the Park Island as well as the indigenous residents of Ma Wan.
23. Mr. Calvin Yip said that the main sources of income for the operation of the FYSH would come from government subsidy for social enterprise, admission fee to the exhibition, fee for joining the eco-tours and education programmes as well as the sale of souvenirs. Noting that the building was relatively small and situated in a remote location, some members worried that it would not be easy to attain financial sustainability. Mr. Calvin Yip said that extra effort would be made to boost its patronage rate by aligning it with nearby tourist attractions such as Ma Wan Park and Noah's Ark. He also informed members that budget had been earmarked for maintenance of the building at around \$60,000 each year starting from the second and third year of operation.
24. A member showed concern about the future business of the FYSH. Mr. Calvin Yip said that upon its project commissioning by mid 2011, an advisory committee would be set up to monitor the development of the project in the form of a social enterprise. In relation to job creation under the project, it was anticipated that 6 full-time jobs and 30 to 40 part-time jobs would be created with priority given to fishermen and the indigenous residents who would organize eco-tours for tourists to the historic sites on Ma Wan. Learning from the experience in providing social services to the elderly, women and the youth by The Yuen Yuen Institute, Mr Calvin Yip showed confidence that 8 to 10 education programmes of Chinese culture and arts would be organized per month at the FYSH for the residents of Ma Wan. Support had been solicited from local organisations such as schools, travel agents, elderly centres, NGOs, District Council etc to ensure that there would be a reliable source of visitors for the FYSH.
25. The Chairman summed up by saying that members of the Board were generally supportive of the mitigation measures proposed in the HIA.

(The presentation team left at this juncture.)

Item 7 Briefing on 1444 historic buildings (proposed Grade I)

26. Members were briefed on seven Grade 1 historic buildings and the remaining buildings would be covered in the forthcoming briefing sessions.

27. For the purpose of catching up with the progress of the briefing for 1,444 historic buildings, Mr. Tom Ming proposed adding more briefing sessions during June and July. The exact schedule would be drawn up by the AAB Secretariat after consultation with members. Although quorum would not be counted for these sessions, the Chairman appealed to members for their attendance.

Item 8 Any Other Business

Proposed formation of Archaeology Panel

28. Ms Heaster Cheung informed Members that the 1st Archaeology Panel Meeting was held on 24 April 2009 in which members asked whether it was procedurally and legally proper for the Panel to directly advise the Antiquities Authority on matters relating to the granting of licenses to excavate and search for antiquities under Section 13 of Cap. 53 without further endorsement of the AAB. She reported that legal advice from the Department of Justice (DoJ) had been obtained which suggested that it would be better for the Board to exercise its function by itself in giving advice to the Antiquities Authority. If a Panel was to be established, it would not be desirable for the Board to rubber-stamp or disregard the Panel's recommendations without applying the Board's mind and decision on the relevant matters.

29. In response to some members' questions, Mr. Tom Ming explained that initial vetting of these applications would be done by AMO to ensure all relevant and required documents were furnished by the applicants before putting up to AAB. Ms Heaster Cheung supplemented that a licence would not be granted to the applicant unless written consent was obtained from not less than half of the number of Board members. Mr. Tom Ming reassured that all comments and advice given by members would be considered carefully and responded to by AMO.

30. Mr. Kevin Sun clarified that according to section 18 of the A&M Ordinance, the Board might advise the Antiquities Authority on any matters relating to antiquities, proposed monuments or monuments or referred to it for consultation under section 2(A), section 3(1) or section 6(4) of the A&M Ordinance. Section 13 of the said ordinance stipulated that the Antiquities Authority might grant to any person a licence to excavate and search for antiquities. He recalled that DoJ had ruled out the possibility of negative vetting and written consent had to be obtained from the members on the granting of licence.

31. After deliberation, members were of the view that the formation of an Archaeology Panel might not be able to expedite the processing of the applications under

section 13 of the A&M Ordinance. The Board therefore decided that the existing arrangement by way of circulation to all Members for vetting/ comments of applications for licences under section 13 of the A&M Ordinance would remain unchanged. The Chairman however advised members to keep active dialogue with stakeholders on archaeological works in Hong Kong with a view to improving the level of transparency of the AAB.

32. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 7: 10 p.m.

Antiquities and Monuments Office
Leisure and Cultural Services Department
September 2009

Ref: LCS AM 22/3